



REVIEWER RUBRIC & SERVICE BOOKLET

Remote Law School Application Materials Review

2026 National HBCU Pre-Law Summit · North Carolina Central University · Durham, NC

This booklet is the working standard for all volunteer reviewers. It sets one shared rubric, one turnaround clock, and one confidentiality practice so that every scholar receives feedback of comparable depth and tone, no matter which reviewer they are assigned.

The three rules that matter most

- Confirm receipt of your packet within 48 hours of assignment.
- Return written feedback within three weeks (21 days) of assignment.
- Delete every copy of the student's files once feedback is returned, then confirm deletion in the hub.

1. Scope of the service

Reviewers may

- Give constructive written feedback on clarity, organization, structure, substance and professionalism.
- Flag grammar, formatting and consistency problems.
- Point out where a prompt is not being answered or a limit is exceeded.
- Ask questions that help the applicant develop their own material.

Reviewers may not

- Rewrite or ghostwrite an applicant's material.
- Predict admission, scholarship or bar outcomes.
- Give legal advice, including advice on character-and-fitness answers.
- Upload a student's materials to an AI platform or third-party service.
- Review materials for an applicant they personally know and cannot assess objectively.

2. Order of priority when time is short

1. Responsiveness to the actual prompt.

2. Substance and evidence — is the claim supported by specifics?
3. Structure and flow.
4. Clarity of sentences and paragraphs.
5. Professional tone and judgment.
6. Formatting and length compliance.
7. Grammar, punctuation and proofreading.

Do not spend the whole packet on line edits. A student is better served by three structural observations than by forty comma corrections.

3. Shared annotation codes

Use these codes in the margin so feedback reads consistently across all reviewers. Pair every code with one sentence of explanation.

Personal statement, essays and addenda

Code	Meaning
PR	Does not answer the prompt, or drifts away from it.
EV	Assertion needs concrete evidence, example or result.
SO	“So what?” — the significance is not drawn out.
ST	Structural issue: order, transition or paragraph purpose.
RD	Redundant — already said, cut or compress.
TN	Tone: too casual, defensive, self-deprecating or grandiose.
VO	Voice risk: sounds borrowed, generic or AI-flat.
CL	Unclear sentence — reader has to reread.
LM	Length, word count or formatting limit issue.
CF	Character-and-fitness content — do not advise; refer to Summit staff.

Résumé

Code	Meaning
AC	Accomplishment missing — duty listed, result not shown.
QT	Quantify: numbers, scale, budget, caseload, hours.
VB	Weak or inconsistent verb tense.
FM	Formatting: alignment, dates, fonts, spacing inconsistent.
OR	Ordering: most relevant experience is buried.
GP	Unexplained gap or ambiguity a reader will notice.
AB	Undefined abbreviation, acronym or campus-specific term.

4. Written feedback summary — required format

Every returned packet includes a short summary in addition to in-document notes. Keep it to roughly half a page per document.

1. **Strengths.** Two or three specific things working well, named concretely.
2. **Priority revisions.** The two or three changes with the highest impact, in order.
3. **Prompt and compliance check.** Does it answer the prompt within the stated limit and format?
4. **Line-level patterns.** Recurring habits rather than a list of every instance.
5. **Next step.** One concrete action for the student's next draft.

Tone standard

- Address the document, not the person: “this paragraph” rather than “you always”.
- Explain the why behind each note so the student can apply it elsewhere.
- Preserve the applicant's voice; suggest, do not substitute.
- Close with encouragement grounded in something real in the document.

5. Final compliance checklist

- The exact prompt is being answered.
- Correct school name throughout.
- Word or page limit respected.
- Formatting requirements met.
- Facts internally consistent with the résumé and application.
- Character-and-fitness disclosures flagged, not advised on.
- School AI and outside-assistance policies acknowledged.
- Grammar and proofreading pass complete.

6. Turnaround standard and status reporting

Day 0	Assignment released You receive the packet in My Volunteer Portal and by email from the Service Desk.
Within 48 hours	Confirm receipt Mark "I received this packet" in the portal. This starts your three-week clock.
When you begin	Mark in review Prevents silent reassignment while you are working.
By day 21	Return feedback Mark reviewed, then returned, and note whether you spoke with the student.
Immediately after	Confirm deletion Delete all copies and record the deletion date in the portal.

Anything still open past its return date is flagged OVERDUE in the reviewer portal and the organizer console, and the Service Desk will follow up. If your circumstances change, say so early — reassignment is routine and is never held against a volunteer.

7. Confidentiality and destruction of student files

- Use the materials only for the assigned review.
- Store them securely; never on a shared or public machine.
- Do not discuss a student's materials with anyone outside the review program.
- Never upload materials to an AI platform or third-party service.
- Return feedback only through the approved channel.
- Disclose conflicts of interest and decline reviews where objectivity is at risk.

Required: destroy student files after the review

- Delete every copy — downloads, email attachments, cloud folders, annotated drafts, printouts.
- Empty trash, deleted items and recycle bin so no recoverable copy remains.
- Shred paper copies; do not recycle them intact.
- Never keep a student's materials as a writing sample, teaching example or portfolio piece.
- Confirm the deletion in My Volunteer Portal. The Summit keeps the date stamp only — never the files.

8. What we ask you to report

We do not ask reviewers to submit a narrative report on a student. Status is what the Summit tracks: received, in review, reviewed, returned, whether you spoke with the student, and files deleted. The optional completion note is for one or two lines about what you focused on — for example "structure and prompt responsiveness" — so organizers can see patterns across the cohort. Substantive feedback belongs to the student, not to our records.

Questions, conflicts or anything that feels outside your role: hbcuprelawsummit@gmail.com, or use the What To Do If... escalation card in the volunteer hub.